Transforming Performance-Based Evaluation: From Checklist to Global Rating Scale

CAOT Conference 2016
Karen Koseck, M.Sc., B. Sc. (OT)
Occupational Therapist
Professor, OTA & PTA Program
Centennial College
What will we learn?

1. The advantages of using a Global Rating Scale (GRS) to evaluate, and predict, clinical performance skills.
2. How the OTA&PTA:GRS was developed to measure student performance-based skills.

Why do we need to evaluate OTA student clinical performance skills anyways?

- **Performance Integrated Into Practice**: eg through direct observation, workplace based assessment
- **Demonstration of Learning**: eg via simulations, OSCEs
- **Interpretation/Application**: eg through case presentations, essays, extended matching type MCQs
- **Fact Gathering**: eg traditional true/false MCQs

Based on work by Miller GE, The Assessment of Clinical Skills/Competence/Performance; Acad. Med. 1990; 65(9); 63-67
Adapted by Drs. R. Mehay & R. Burns, UK (Jan 2009)
Evaluating Student Clinical Performance Skills

- Current Practices
  - Practical Skills Evaluations (e.g. OSCEs)
  - Scenarios (stations) are developed
  - Student performs skills
  - Performance is scored

- Evaluation Tools
  - Checklists
  - Combination Checklists and GRS
  - GRS
What is a Global Rating Scale?

• A measure to evaluate performance
• Rate performance using observation skills and expert judgment
• Establishes pattern of behaviour across different scenarios
Why use a GRS?

Research Evidence in Use of GRS

Predicting Patterns of Performance
Development of the OTA&PTA: GRS

✓ Needs Assessment – No GRS for OTA&PTA students

☐ Determine Dimensions of Practice - Competencies/Key indicators
  • Performance –based
  • All-encompassing
  • Mutually exclusive

☐ Develop descriptors for each dimension

☐ Develop Rating Scale – sensitive, easily discriminates different levels of performance
Establishing Validity

- Survey was developed to obtain feedback on each dimension, descriptor and score rating
- Survey was sent electronically to content experts at 16 different colleges with OTA and/or PTA programs across Canada.
- 100% survey response rate
- Consensus was met after the first round of the Delphi process with over 80% agreement
OTA&PTA: GRS - Dimensions

1. Accountability & Professionalism
2. Preparation (Client and Environment)
3. Treatment Implementation
4. Critical Thinking (Problem Solving & Judgment)
5. Communication (Verbal and Non-Verbal)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ACCOUNTABILITY &amp; PROFESSIONALISM</th>
<th>Very Good</th>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Needs Improvement</th>
<th>Unsatisfactory or Unsafe</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Individual’s overall ability to behave in a professional manner. Personal presentation: student wears appropriate attire with name identifier and is well groomed. Greets client and confirms their identity. Obtains informed consent by introducing self (name and discipline), explaining what treatment will be provided and why, and receives permission. Client is treated with respect and dignity (e.g. draping). Performs assigned duties as instructed within capabilities.
OTA&PTA: GRS – Rating Scale

5 – Very Good
4 – Good
3 – Satisfactory
2 – Needs Improvement
1 – Unsatisfactory/Unsafe
How to Score Competency Using the OTA&PTA GRS

- Once the students have completed all stations, overall performance is scored
- Students do not pass or fail a station
- Score across all stations for each competency
  - Looking for predictable patterns of behaviour.
- Students must pass each competency in order to be successful in the lab courses.
Benefits & Challenges of Using the OTA&PTA GRS

• **Benefits:**
  - Better predictor of future clinical performance
  - Demonstration of knowledge transfer to practical application.

• **Challenges:**
  - Evaluators need training to use the tool – scoring tips – paradigm shift
Now What?

Next Steps

1. Create on-line training tutorial for evaluators
   - In progress

2. Film 10 scenarios for reliability studies
   - Done

3. Multi-site intra- and inter-rater reliability study
Questions and Feedback

• Further questions or comments?

Contact Information:
Karen Koseck, M.Sc., B. Sc. (OT)
Occupational Therapist
Professor, OTA & PTA Program
kkoseck@centennialcollege.ca

If you would like a handout, please add name and e-mail to sheet.
Applied Research and Innovation Fund, Centennial College, has provided funds for the development of an on-line training tutorial for evaluators and for filming 10 scenarios to be used for future reliability studies.
References


Canadian Association of Occupational Therapists (February, 2009). *Practice profile for support personnel in occupational therapy*. Ottawa, ON: CAOT Publications ACE.


Hodges, B. et al., *OSCE checklists do not capture increasing levels of expertise*. Academic Medicine, 1999. 74(10): p. 1129-1134

Hodges B, McIlroy JH. *Analytic global OSCE ratings are sensitive to level of training*. Medical Education 2003; 37(11):1012-6


Images

- https://lbookbliss.files.wordpress.com/2013/05/5_star_ratings.png